Ethical Dilemmas in Management

Edited by
Christina Garsten and
Tor Hernes
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of illustrations</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of contributors</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction: dilemmas of ethical organizing</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHRISTINA GARSTEN AND TOR HERNES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From (ir)responsibility to accountability</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some deeper questions</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faith in formal standards and structure</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The power of dilemmas</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Risk, responsibility and conscience</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TORE BAKKEN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morality and responsibility</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The morality of risk</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The risk of morality</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscience and responsibility</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The conscience of the individual</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The conscience of society</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 White as snow or milk?</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOR HERNES, GERRARD E. SCHJELDERUP AND ANNE LIVE VAAGAASAR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Companies and presentation</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discourse as structures of things</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The making of a dairy corporation and its changing discursive structure</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleanliness and ethics</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ethical dilemmas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Work?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ethical dilemmas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Overmanagement and the problem of moral consciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Tying some ends together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The culture at Enron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Leadership mechanisms and organizational culture at Enron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Attention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Reaction to crises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Role modelling (how leaders behave)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Allocation of rewards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Criteria of selection and dismissal (how leaders hire and fire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>No smoke without fire?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>TODD BRIDGMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Business schools and CSR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Constituting the business school and its conscience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Articulation 1: The vocational/professional school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Articulation 2: The academic department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Articulation 3: The commercial enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Overmanagement and the problem of moral consciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>HERVE LAROCHE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Judgemental pressure and overmanagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Strong involvement and overmanagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Overmanagement and moral consciousness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Tying some ends together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>CHRISTINA GARSTEN AND TOR HERNES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Discursive structures and how to make sense of them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Lightning rods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Demarcation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Articulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Visibilization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Index</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
academic freedom: business schools 127; legal status 128; nodal points 125; university sponsorship 118, 129
academics: career advancement 120; critical intellectuals 120, 124–5, 128; experts 124; publications 120
accountability: awareness 144; business cost 84; ethics 71; legal responsibility 2; public institutions 2; sanctions 72–3; transparency 65; voluntary governance 66
accounting practices 104, 106, 108
activism: AIDS 93; articulation 157; Burma 87; calculus of response 84–6; firms 84, 97; genetically modified organisms 93; lawsuits 80; Nike 90–2; Novartis 94; South Africa 83; Yadana 87 activists 70–1, 79
AIDS 93, 94
Akhigbe, Aigbe 83, 97
Allende, Salvador (President, Chile) 1
allocation of rewards 110–11
Always, T. 109
ambiguity 136, 139, 142, 143
Andersen, Arthur 4, 9
antagonism 122, 123
apartheid 1
Apparel Industry Partnership (AIP) 92
Arthur Andersen 104
articulation 155–7
attention 107–8
audit society 2
autonomy 134
Avolio, B.J. 61–2
Bakaa, Joel 119
Ballinger, Jeff (activist) 90, 91
Bankgok 45
Bass, B.M. 57
Bauman, Zygmunt 3, 19
Beck, Ulrich 11, 19
Becker, T.E. 57, 58
behaviour: consistency 56; Enron 107; faking 133; leaders 58; over time 61; penalties 43; rules 45; transparency 74; unethical 43, 110; unprofessional 43; untrustworthy 54
behavioural rules: effectiveness 9
Bentham, Jeremy 68–9
Beyer, J.M. 33
Bhopal disaster 1, 2
Boles, T.L. 54
bonuses 111
Bossidy, Larry 112
brand identity 68, 84–5, 95–6, 129
British American Tobacco 117–18
Burma: foreign investors 89; natural gas firms 82; non-governmental organizations (NGOs) 81; sanctions 88; Unocal 86–90
business 1, 53
business ethics 12–13, 15, 141
business schools: as academic departments 118; academic departments 124–5; as business units 118, 125; chains of equivalence 124; collaboration with industry 123; conscience 121–2; consultancy role 122, 124; Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) 117, 118–21; as critics 124; decision makers 118; discourse 149; funding 123, 125, 128; independence 126–7, 128, 129; ivory towers 124; knowledge economy 125–8; management 149; professional 122–4; research 124; role in society 121; role of research 123; teaching as priority 122; three articulations 122–9; vocational 122–4; as watchdogs 129
Index

Byers, Stephen (Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, UK) 125-6

Carr, J. 47, 48, 49

chains of equivalence: ivory towers 125; three articulations 122

Chapman, S.: university sponsorship 117

civil rights: growing concern 1

code of conduct 44, 48, 49, 156, 157-8

Coherence 136, 156

communication: accountability 73; Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) 69-71; lack of 110; social accountability 71; strategies 37; superficial 136; transparency 67, 69, 74

companies: discursive structures 159; ethical dilemmas 158; ethical dimensions 150; ethical guidelines 151; focus 157; image promotion 4; organization of activities 28; political agendas 1; in society 148; sponsorship 13; strategies 1

company image 2

Compco 44, 47; code of conduct 48

Competitive culture 106

compliance with NGOs 137

Compromise 6-7

Confidentiality 68

Conflict 46, 48

Conflict of interest: academic freedom 126; Enron 104; funding 127; rules relaxed 108; university sponsorship 118

Conscience: business schools 121-2; consistency 60; control mechanism 24; dualism 24; humanity 21; individual 20-2; 25; internalization 51; leaders 60; moral philosophy 20; personal 24; personal integrity 50; responsibility 19-20; sexual harassment 50-1; society 22-5; vocational business schools 123; warning 22

Consequences: lying 58; unexpected 12

Consistency 55, 56-7, 60

Consumers 72

Cooperatives 3

Coping mechanisms: sexual harassment 48

Corporate activities: ethical dilemmas 71

Corporate actors: accountability 1; influence policy 2

Corporate culture see also organizational culture: Euro 112-13; ethical awareness 51; role modeling 109

corporate plans: high involvement levels 138

corporate scandals: disclosure 65

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR): business schools 128, 129; code of conduct 71, 150; communication 69; consultancy 70-1; duty 13; Enron 103, 113; ethical conduct 4; ethical dilemmas 151; future dilemmas 153; governance 65; large companies 4; limits 5; manipulation 6; motives 13; Novartis 94; role of universities 119; self-imposed 2; standards 71-2, 158; transparency 65, 75; universities 118, 119, 121; university sponsorship 117; Unocal 89; visualization 158

corporations: coherence 150; conscience 119; evolution 8; image promotion 67; overmanagement 133; role in society 3; transparency 67; trust 66

cost benefit calculation: activism 84
court rulings: misconduct 2
crisis: reaction 108-9

croson, R.T.A.: trust 54
customer groups: products 31
dairy products: national culture 32
defeit: necessary 58
decision makers: consistency 56; ethics 69; ignore problems 151; personal preferences 80; political agendas 18-19; stakeholders 28; unexpected behaviours 12
decision-making: tension 19
decoupling: outsourcing 6
demarcation: discursive structures 153-5
democracy: freedom 119; universities 129
deregulation: experimentation 105
dilemmas: organizations 8

discourse: analysis 40; of enterprise 126; organizational practice 30; of partnerships 123, 126; of practice 123; of science 124, 125; theory 121-2
discursive strategies: communication 28; countering 36-7; cover up 39; diversification 32, 36; ethical dilemmas 30; repackaging 37-8; structural decoupling 38-9; TINE 38
discursive structures: coherence 156; companies 148, 149-50; corporate identity 35; demarcation 153-5; diversification 36; leadership structures 30; organizational composition 30-1;
Index

163

Economist, The: Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) 119
employees: Code of Ethics 110; Enron 107; entrepreneurial behaviour 109; ethics 105–6; faking behaviour 150; focus 107; high involvement levels 139; progression 110; employment contract 44, 68; Enron: accounting practices 108; bankruptcy 104; bonuses 111; Code of Ethics 109–10; compensation structure 110; competitive culture 106; corporate culture 112–13; Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) 103; corruption 103; credit rating 106; demarcation 154–5; disclosure 110; executive behaviour 107; facade of success 106; hidden losses 104; history 104; organizational culture 103; partnerships 104–5; recruitment and retention 111–12; Enron scandal 4, 5, 9, 74, 103, 105; environment 1; environmental accounting 5; Epstein, Marc 83, 97; equality 1; ethical: audits 42; conduct 4, 6, 9, 128; issues 7; reflexivity 67, 74, 75; ethical dilemmas: business schools 121; consciousness 20; countering 36–7; discursive structures 151; diversification 35–6; education 9; ignored 142; moral consciousness 141–2; organizational ideology 9; TINE 32; transparency 69; treatment 8; university sponsorship 118; ethics: awareness 144; in business 129; cleanliness 34–5; consciousness 132; decision makers 69, 142; duty 17; Enron 103; eroded 106, 133; future 16, 17, 153; immediate life 22; organizationalization 51; leadership 57–8; moral contracts 16; new technology 16; obstacles 107; organizational culture 114; overmanagement 141; philosophical foundation 8; profit maximization 104; responsibility 26; social context 11; tobacco industry 117; violations 113; evaluations 134–5; exclusion 14; expediency 136–7; experience 60; Fair Labor Association (FLA) 92; Fastow, Andrew (Chief Financial Officer, Enron) 104, 105, 106, 108; Financial Accounting Standards Board (FASB) 104; firms: competition 84; compliance with NGOs 85, 96–7; damage control 83; interaction with NGOs 83, 97; response to NGOs 95; transaction costs 84–5; Florini, Ann 73; follower relationship 54, 58; Foucault, Michel 26, 69; Franks, Lord 123; Free Burma Coalition (FBC) 79, 87–8; Friedman, Monroe 83; Fuss, P. 50; Gardner, W. L. 61–2; Garsten, Christina 69–70; Geneen, Harold 1; Ghosh, Pal G. 73; Gifford, Kathie Lee 91; Gilnow, M.A. von 35; Global Alliance for Workers and Communities 92; globalization 2, 3, 6, 10, 64–5; Goodpaster, K.E. 22–3, 51, 144; governance 44, 65, 66; government 119, 129; Greer, L. 114; Habermas, J. 16; Hackett, S. 84; Hamilton, James T. 84; Hawthorne effect 136; health 35; health hazard 32, 33, 37; health risks 93; Hegel, G. W. F. 26; Heidegger, M. 17, 20, 21, 22; Herbst, Philip 15; high involvement levels: control...
Index

mechanism 138; improved performance 133; judgemental pressure 139; negative effects 138, 139–40; overmanagement 137–8; processes 142; vagueness 139; higher education 128
Hirschman, A.O. 25
honesty 53–5, 59, 61
House, D. 120
human resources 59
human rights 1, 4, 79
humanity 16, 21, 25
Huntley, A. 47, 48, 49
identity 42, 68
image promotion 68
Imle, John (President, Unocal) 89
impressions management 67
impulse control 50
Indonesia 90
information 61, 68, 137, 145
innovation 105
Institute of Business Ethics (IBE) 44
integrity: challenges 58; consistency 60, 61; follower relationship 58–9; individuals 127; institutions 118; interpretations 53; lying 54; managers 57; personal 68
intellectual property 126
interdependency 21
International Centre for Corporate Social Responsibility 117
international jurisdiction 3
International Labor Organization (ILO) 88
Jackall, Robert 142, 143; Moral Mazes 132
Jansen, E. 55
Jenkins, I. 50
Jobs, Steve (CEO, Apple Inc) 30
Jonas, Hans: Imperative of Responsibility, The 15
judgemental pressure 137, 142, 145
judgements 135
justice 49, 56, 60
Kant, I.: Categorical Imperative 12, 26; duty 13; honesty 58
Kitchen, Louise 110
Knight, Frank: Risk, Uncertainty and Profit 11
Knight, Phil (Founder, Nike Inc.): announces reforms 91–2; communication 30; Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) 92; mass production 90; National Press Club speech 91
knowledge 16, 120, 125
knowledge economy 121, 126
Koku, Paul 83, 97
Konar, Shameek 83
Kouzes, J.M. 53, 55, 61–2
Kwok, Chuck 84
labor conditions 92
Laclau, E. 121, 124, 154
Latour, Bruno 33
lawsuits 88
Lawton, A. 114
lay, Kenneth (CEO, Enron) 108, 109, 111
Leader-Member Exchange (LMX) theory 54–5
leaders 58, 59, 60–1
leadership: attention 107–8; challenges 58–60; communication 108; consistency 53, 55; decision makers 106; Enron 104, 110; ethics 57–8, 109; fairness 57; honesty 53; hypocrisy 55; integrity 53; mechanisms 103, 107; organizational culture 111; over time 56; reaction to crises 108–9; secrets 59–60; truthfulness 53; value systems 58, 62
legislation 4, 14, 113–14
lies 54, 58
lightning rods 152–3
Luhmann, Niklas 15, 24, 25; Paradigm Lost 17
Lyon, T. 84
Maccoby, M. 56
MacQuarrie, B. 47, 48, 49
management: academic field of study 124–5; allocation of rewards 110; awareness 144; commitment 139; dilemmas 159; discourse 119; discourse of practice 123; ethical decision making 7–8; focus 155; literature 138; mandates 133–4; priorities 144; as a profession 123; strategy 92; vagueness 138–9
managers: ambiguity 134; communication 73; credibility 57; decision makers 28, 86; ethical ambivalence 59; ethical dilemmas 71; evaluations 133; evaluative pressures 134, 135; faked involvement 139; honesty dilemmas 53; judgemental pressure 133; moral consciousness 144; non-governmental organizations
Index

Patten, Dennis 84
perceptions 56, 58–9, 60, 61
performance 105, 111–12, 133, 138
Perrow, Charles. Normal Accidents: Living
with high-risk Technologies 12
Plato 23
political agendas 1, 33
Posner, B.Z. 53, 55, 61–2
power 45, 49
Power, Michael 65, 72
practitioners 122, 138
Press for Change 91
principles 20
products 35–6
profit maximization 80, 95, 96, 119, 129
project 45–8
Pruitt, Stephen 83
psychological relationships 137–8
public institutions 1, 2
public intellectuals 120
public opinion 68, 95
public sector 13
publications 124–5
Rand, Ayn 57
Raptors 105
recruitment 65–6
repackaging: diverting attention 37
representation 29–30
reputation 55, 57, 94, 96, 106
research 36–7, 117–18
Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) 121,
124–5
responsibility 69, 71
risk: calculation 11, 12; consequentialist
ethics 15–16; genetically modified
organisms 93; of morality 17–19; new
technology 16; trust 66
risk society 11, 15, 19, 66, 153
romanticism 38
Rose, Steven 50, 75
Rowland, W. 42, 51
rules 42–3
sanctions 13, 151
Sartre, J.P. 22; Existentialism and
humanism 17
Schein, Edgar: allocation of rewards
110–11; attention 107–8; organizational
culture 104, 113; reaction to crises
108–9; recruitment and retention
111–12; role modeling 109–10
Schnietz, Karen 83, 97
Schweitzer, M.E. 55
science 33
Scientific Foundation 109
Securities and Exchange Commission 105
self-discipline 69
Sennett, Richard 18, 42, 51
sexual harassment: abuse of power 49;
avoidance 47–8; complexity 49; conflict
48; continued 47; coping mechanisms
47; culture 50; management 51; not
reported 47; organizational systems 49;
penalties 43; personal responsibility 49;
response 46, 47, 49; sustained 45–6
shareholders 84
Shatenstein, S. 117
Skilling, Jeffrey (CEO, Enron) 105, 107,
108, 110, 111
slavery 81
Smith, Richard 117
social affairs 67
social context 11, 12, 25
social transformation 3
society: companies 148; conscience 25;
freedom 119; moral climate 42; moral
code 12; moral discourse 42; moral
purpose 119; moral values 51
South Africa 1, 83–4
Springer, Thomas 83, 97
stakeholders: companies 148; corporate
actions 150; Corporate Social
Responsibility (CSR) 72, 119; decision
makers 28; demarcation 154; discursive
structures 149–50; focus 151, 155, 159;
transparency 71
standard rules 8
standards: endogenous 4; exogenous
4; implicit 4; institutionalization 4; multiple
6; proxies 72; smokescreen 5
State Law and Order Restoration Council
(SLORC - Burma) 86–7, 88, 89
Steidlmeier, P. 57
Stern, G. 108
Stewart, Martha 53
stress 135
structural discourse 148–9
structural dislocation 122
Sullivan Principles 83
Synnove Finnden 38–9
technology 33
Teoh, Siew Hong 83–4
TINE: competition 39; corporate