Acting with Technology

Activity Theory and Interaction Design

Victor Kaptelinin and Bonnie A. Nardi

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

Contents

List of Figures vii
List of Tables ix
Acknowledgments xi

I Activity Theory in Interaction Design 1

1 Introduction 3

2 Do We Need Theory in Interaction Design? 15

3 Activity Theory in a Nutshell 29

4 Interaction Design Informed by Activity Theory 73

5 A Design Application of Activity Theory: The UMEA System 117

II Advanced Issues in Activity Theory 135

6 Objectively Speaking 137

7 Objects of Desire 153

8 Historical Currents in the Development of Activity Theory 173

III Theory in Interaction Design 193

9 Postcognitivist Theories in Interaction Design 195

10 Artifacts, Agency, and (A)symmetry 237

11 Looking Forward 253

Appendix A: The Activity Checklist 269
Appendix B: Online Resources on Activity Theory 279
Notes 283
References 293
Index 325

Index

Ackerman, M., 231–232
Actions, internalizing, 180
Active Badge, system, 133
Activities: Revue Electronique, 280
Activity, Consciousness and Personality (Leontiev), 3
Activity-based computing (ABC), 6, 104, 279
Activity-centered design, 95–96
Activity checklist, 96, 98, 269
 design version, 274
 evaluation version, 272
 sample questions, 276
Activity concept
 agency, 32
 asymmetry, 33
 automatization, 63
 basic notion, 31
 development, 32
 needs and motives, 59–61
 origins, 55
 psyche evolution, 51
 subjective and objective, 31, 60
Activity exchange, 111
Activity-oriented design method (AODM), 101
Activity spaces, 102, 104
Activity theory
 advanced issues, 135
 agency, 239, 248
 analytical tools, 96, 188
 applications and systems, 104–108
 asymmetry, 10
collective subject, 187
common sense, 262
communication, 185–188
community, 99, 267
competition, 185n
conceptual gap, 141–143
consciousness, 8
continuity and discontinuity, 173–178
cultural-historical psychology, 35, 39
design and evaluation, 96, 117
development, 11, 40, 71, 108, 254
diversity of tools, 102
doable problems, 155n
Engeström's activity system model, 98–102, 142
environments vs. tools, 255–256
ethnomethodology, 86, 97
external behavior, 69
future prospects, 253
general methodology, 40
goals and engagement, 258
hierarchical structure, activities, actions and operations, 62, 64, 67
hierarchies vs. triangles, 141–143
historical overview, 73–77
individual and collective, 46, 188, 260
information technology, 3, 114
insights and principles, 65–72
intentionality, 10
interaction design, 11, 27, 73, 253
internal-external, 41–48

Activity theory (cont.)
international interest, 3
linguistic gap, 138–141
main ideas, 65
means and ends, 98
mediation, 41–46, 70–71, 230, 255
mental processes, 69
microlevel methods, 257
microstructural analysis, 184
motive vs. object, 143, 153
multiple activities, 256
needs and motives, 59–61, 165
object concept, 31–32, 55, 61, 66, 137–150, 153, 156
object-orientedness, 66–67, 137
online resources, 279–282
organizational forms, 175
origins, 35
polymotivated activities, 144
principles, 9, 11, 66–72
procedural representation, 257
revising framework, 143–150
Russian psychology, 35, 73, 138, 178
self-reflexive, 13
social nature of the human mind, 37, 65–66
software design, 23
subject concept, 31–32
technology design, 264
transparency concept, 79
true motive, 144
understanding collaboration, 85–95
unity of consciousness and activity, 8, 36–37, 65–66
variety of frameworks, 178–185
workplace studies, 83–85
Activity Theory Usability Lab, 279
Actor-network theory
agency, 237, 251
distributed cognition, 201
generalized symmetry, 201, 237n
interaction design, 195, 199
Affordance
activity theory, 80
operational, 81
Agency, 243–248
activity theory, 239, 248
actor-network theory, 237, 251
artifacts, 248
asymmetry, 238
biological needs, 242–243
conditional, 248
cultural needs, 242–243
defining, 241
delegated, 248
human-machine, 243
material and human, 239
need-based, 247
typology, 241, 243
Andreeva, G., 187
Animals, psychological functions, 54
Anthropology, interaction design, 17
Apple Data Detectors, system, 98
Arievitch, I., 207
Artifacts, 248–251
actor-network theory, 249
agency, 248
creativity, 217
cultural needs, 248
mediating, 174
programmable, 250
Wartofsky's typology, 217
Arvonen, T., 86, 100
Asymmetry, 238–241
actor-network theory, 238
agency, 239
human practice, 239

Baerentsen, K., 81
Bakhtin, M., 190
Bannon, L., 74, 253
Bardram, J., 88, 103
Basov, M., 174–178
Bateson, G., 71
Bazerman, C., 220
Beaudouin-Lafon, M., 83
Béguin, P., 111, 220, 226–227
Bellamy, R., 198
Bellotti, V., 255
Bernstein, N., 183
Bødker, S., 71, 74, 76, 78

BodyWise, fitness system, activity theory, 106
Bolshevik Revolution, 36
Bowers, J., 15
Brint, S., 18
Brown, J. S., 261
Brown, S., 207
Buddha, 9
BUILD-IT system, 107
Burke, K., 190
Button, G., 21–22

Card, S., 120
Carmien, S., 264–267
Carroll, J., 74, 267
Cell phones, waste management, 13
Center for Activity Theory and Developmental Work Research, 280
Cerrato Pargman, T., 111
Change laboratory, 109
Children, learning behavior, 8
Citizen panels, technology, 233
Clark, A., 225
Clot, Y., 220, 226–227
Clusters of artifacts, 85
Co-construction
 creativity, 224
 postcognitivist theory, 220
Cognitive science
 activity checklist, 98
 activity theory, 8, 183
 interaction design, 15
Cognitivist paradigm, 15–22
Cole, M., 90–91
Collaborative writing, 111
Collective activity, 187, 260
Collins, P., 100
Communication, activity theory, 185–188
Community, activity theory, 99, 267
Competencies, functional organs, 64
Computer gaming, fantasy play, 216
Computer Support for Collaborative Learning (CSCL)
 activity theory, 89–96
 domain-centered, 94
 Fifth Dimension project, 90
 learner-centered, 94
Computer-Supported Cooperative Work (CSCW)
 activity theory, 4, 75, 85
 distributed cognition, 195
 ethnomethodology, 86
 information systems, 113
Consciousness
 activity theory, 8
 conscious and automatic processes, 68
 unity of consciousness and activity, 36
Constructivism, Piaget's psychology, 38
Constructivist learning environments, 102
Context and Consciousness: Activity Theory and Human–Computer Interaction (Nardi), 4
Contextualization, downward and upward, 92
Continuity and discontinuity, 173–178
Conversation analysis, ethnomethodology, 18
Cooper, G., 15
Cooperation
 creativity, 222
 postcognitivist theory, 220
Coordination
 creativity, 221
 distributed cognition, 221
 postcognitivist theory, 220
Coordinator, system, 163
Creativity
 activity vs. system, 226
 artifacts, 217
 co-construction, 224
 cooperation, 222
 coordination, 221
 defining, 214
 distributed cognition, 225
 interaction design, 208, 210
 phenomenology, 215

Cultural-historical activity theory (CHAT), 36, 50
Culture change, interaction design, 209
Curation
 bidirectional, 166
 bottom-up criteria, 162
 clinical considerations, 162
 drug delivery, 162
 humanitarian view, 167
 intellectual property, 161
 market direction, 161
 profit motive, 161
 scientific interest, 159, 162, 166
 top-down criteria, 161
Cyborg, 250

Danish Board of Technology, 233
Davydov, V., 181–182
Deautomization, 63
DeCortis, F., 230
Dedicated project spaces, 120
Designing Interaction: Psychology at the Human–Computer Interface (Carroll), 74
Direct manipulation, human–computer interface, 82
Disneyland, 215n
Distributed cognition
 coordination, 221
 creativity, 225
 culture role, 204n
 interaction design, 195, 202
 media definition, 202
 tool mediation, 203
Division of labor, evolution of mind, 56–59
Domain-centered design, 93–94
Domain objects vs. interaction instruments, 83
Double stimulation, psychological function, 44
Dourish, P., 19, 21–22, 200
Draper, S., 112
Ducheneaut, N., 255

Ecological psychology, 180
Education
 information technology, 12
 interaction design, 27
 psychology, 181
 remediation, 92
Emirbayer, M., 227
Emotion, activity theory, 261
Engeström, Y., 3, 30, 73, 91–92, 99, 108, 141, 143, 154, 158, 191, 219, 255, 260
Environment
 activity checklist, 98
 activity theory, 175
 psyche evolution, 53
Enyedy, N., 93
Ergonomics, instrumental genesis, 110
Essential generalizations, 181
Ethnomethodology, interaction design, 16–22

Fantasy play, computer gaming, 216
Faust (Goethe), 35
Fichtner, B., 220
Fifth Dimension project, 90, 282
Fjeld, M., 107
Folcher, V., 111
Formative experiment, 41
Foundations of General Psychology (Rubinshtein), 178
Fujimura, J., 155
Functional organs, activity theory, 64, 249

Galperin, P., 179–181
Galperin's theory, stage-by-stage formation of psychological functions, 179
Games, interaction design, 27
Garfinkel, H., 17, 20–21
Gay, G., 228–230
Geertz, C., 19
Geisler, C., 230–231
General Foundations of Pedology (Basov), 174

Genre tracing, activity theory, 112
Gestalt psychology, 37
Gherardi, S., 198
Gibson, J. J., 80, 180
Gifford, B., 93
Glaser, D., 238–240
GOMS models, 7
Goodwin, C., 20
Grudin, J., 267

Halloran, J., 18, 102
Halverson, C., 231–232
Hamlet, 154
Hedestig, U., 92, 228
Heidegger, M., 201
Hembrooke, H., 228–230
Henderson, A., 120
Higher psychological functions, mediation and internalization, 41–48
Hollan, J., 202, 205
Housekeeping (Robinson), 247
Human–computer interaction (HCI). *See also* Interaction design
  activity theory, 4, 15, 34, 74, 85, 114
  affordance concept, 80
  applications and systems, 104
  cognitivist paradigm, 15–22
  direct manipulation, 82
  distributed cognition, 195
  early research, 5
  East–West conferences, 75
  extending scope, 77–79
  first-wave HCI, 15, 33, 74
  reframing, 77–83
  rethinking concepts, 79–83
  second-wave HCI, 15, 74
  technology role, 78
  transparency, 79
  user system, 35
Human mind
  activity theory, 51
  cultural impact, 39, 56
  development, 51, 56
  division of labor, 57
  internalization–externalization, 68
  social nature, 37, 46
  tools and language, 56
Hutchins, E., 202, 204–205, 220–221, 223–224, 226
Hybrid theoretical frameworks, interaction design, 110–113
Hyysalo, S., 155, 258

Ilyenkov, E., 227
Individual activities, 260
Industrial design, activity theory, 106
Informatics, 5, 113
Information systems
  activity theory, 114
  interaction design, 113
  objects and spaces, 84, 121
  research, 113–115
Information technology
  activity theory, 3
  applications as environments, 117
  design and implementation, 106–108
  education, 12
  Finnish hospital, 108
  long-term impact, 12
  organizational prototyping, 103
Innovations, activity systems, 109
Instrumental act, mediation, 42
Instrumental genesis, activity theory, 110
Instrumental interaction, 83
Intellectual property, curation process, 161
Intentionality
  activity theory, 10
  actor-network theory, 199
Interaction design. *See also* Human–computer interaction
  activity theory, 73, 253
  analytical tools, 96–103
  antitheory problems, 18
  applications and systems, 104–108
  challenges, 24–28
  characterizing people, 199–208

Interaction design (cont.)
cognitive theory, 15, 24
collaboration, understanding, 85–95
community resource, 267
defining, 4
ethnomethodology, 15, 24
evaluation, 96–103
expanding scope, 25
guidelines, 176
historical overview, 73–77
holistic view, 253
hybrid frameworks, 110–113
implications, 33
information systems, 113–115
need for theory, 22–24
postcognitivist theory, 195
procedural representations, 257
recent trends, 25
theory, 193
workplace studies, 83, 108
Interaction Design Center (Ireland), 281
Interaction histories, human–computer interaction, 123
Internalization, Russian psychology, 43
International Society for Cultural and Activity Research (ISCAR), 281
Interpsychological functions, 47, 70
Intrapsychological functions, 47, 70
Invisible Computer, The: Why Good Products Can Fail (Norman), 104

James, W., 71
Jonassen, D., 102
Jones, M., 204
Journal of Computer-Supported Cooperative Work, 282

Kaptelinin, V., 92, 98, 218, 228
Kimura, system, 133
Kirsh, D., 18, 198
Köhler, W., 53
Koschmann, T., 89
Kuutti, K., 86, 100, 114

Laboratory of Comparative Human Cognition (LCHC), 282
Lave, J., 210
Learning. *See also* Education
activity checklist, 98
activity theory, 8
computer-mediated, 93
Learning-centered design, 93–94
Leontiev, A., 3, 29–31, 38–51, 58, 70, 137, 139–150, 155, 157, 163, 165, 173, 179, 183, 185–187, 189, 196, 206, 208, 212, 228, 247, 250, 255, 261–262
Leontiev, D., 148
Lifestreams, system, 122
Linguistic gap, activity theory, 138–141
Lomov, B., 185–187, 189
Löwgren, J., 4–5
Luria, A., 206
Lynch, M., 17, 20–21

Macaulay, C., 98
Machine intelligence, 203n
Magic Touch, system, 133
MAPS-Lifeline, system, 264–266
Marxist philosophy, Russian psychology, 37
Massively multiplayer online games (MMOGs), 27, 216
Mediation. *See also* Tool mediation
activity theory, 70, 190
higher psychological functions, 41–48
Memory, task performance, 45
Mental processes vs. external behavior, 69
Metafunctional competencies, functional organs, 218
Metropolis (film), 250
Middleton, D., 207
Miettinen, R., 13, 23, 109, 155, 167, 200, 202, 218–219, 235
Mische, A., 227
Mind. *See* Human mind

Mind, Culture, and Activity: An International Journal, 282
Mind–body dualism, 196
Moscow School of Psychology, 179, 184
Motives
 linkages, 169
 vs. objects, 157
 psychological theory, 155n
Multiple activities, office work, 256
Mwanza, D., 101

Nanotechnology, 26
Nardi, B., 23, 76, 88, 98
Natural psychological functions, mediation and internalization, 41–48
Neuroscience, 197
Nicolini, D., 198
Norman, D., 104, 112, 213

Objects
 activity theory, 66
 constructing, 153, 156
 instantiating, 153
 vs. motives, 157
 orientedness, 66
 power and passion, 153
Organizational prototyping, 103
Orienting basis of activity, Galperin's theory, 179

Paradox of technomethodology, 21
Pedology, defining, 174n
Personal information management (PIM), 120
Petrovsky, A., 187
Phenomenology
 creativity, 215
 intentionality, 200
 interaction design, 195
 tool mediation, 200
Physics, Gestalt psychology, 38
Piaget, J., 38
Pickering, A., 237–240
Plans and Situated Actions (Suchman), 16
Plath, S., 213
Pogo, environment for children, 230
Postcognitivist theories. *See also* Activity theory; Actor-network theory; Distributed cognition; Phenomenology
 individual and world, 205–208
 interaction design, 195
 sorting out, 198–208
Presto, system, 122
Primary artifacts, Wartofsky's typology, 217
Problems of the Development of Mind (Leontiev), 51, 139
Project contexts, automatic switching, 132
Prototyping, information technology, 103
Psyche evolution
 activity concept, 51, 55
 animals, 54
 biological view, 52–55
Psychological functions, development stages, 54
Psychological tools, 42
Psychology
 defining tools, 42n
 Marxism, 281

Rabardel, P., 110
Radzikhovsky, L., 188–191
Rae, J., 237
Raeithel, A., 199, 221
Redmiles, D., 100
Reflexivity
 consciousness, 228
 distributed cognition, 231
 interaction design, 208, 228
Resistance, interaction design, 208, 232
Responsiveness, evolution of mind, 53. *See also* Sensitivity, evolution of mind

Rizzo, A., 230
RoamWare, system, 133
Robinson, M., 247
Robotics, 26
Rogers, Y., 102
Rohrer-Murphy, L., 102
ROOMS, system, 120–121
Rorty, R., 24
Rose, J., 204
Roth, W.-M., 3
Rubinshtein, S., 178–179
Russian psychology
 activity theory, 35, 73, 138, 178
 developmental research, 40
 formative experiments, 39
 general methodology, 40
 individual boundaries, 50
 internal and external, 41–48
 molar analysis, 39

Saari, E., 155
Sachs, P., 86–87, 198
Sacks, H., 17, 20, 22
Sandberg, J., 206
Saudelli, B., 230
Scaife, M., 102
Scandinavian Journal of Information Systems, 77
School children, 230
Science, 241
Sclove, R., 233
Scribner, S., 198
Secondary artifacts, Wartofsky's typology, 217–218
Semiotic activity, 190
Sensitivity, evolution of mind, 53. *See also* Responsiveness, evolution of mind
Shneiderman, B., 28, 82
Short message service (SMS), 100
Shukla, S., 100
Simon, H., 7
Situated action, ethnomethodology, 19
Social change, tertiary artifacts, 219
Social distribution, human mind, 46
Society, technology, 261
Sociobiology, 197
Sociology, ethnomethodology, 17
Software design, activity theory, 23
Spinuzzi, C., 112, 222, 225
Stetsenko, A., 207, 260
Stolterman, E., 4–5
Subjective experiences, activity theory, 178
Suchman, L., 16–17, 20, 87
Suprasituational activities, learning environments, 92
Sutter, B., 157
Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (Zurich), 107
Symmetrical vocabularies, 235n
Systemic Structural Theory of Activity (SSTA), 280

Task(s), human–computer interaction, 34
Task-related competencies, functional organs, 64
Technical tools, 42
Technology. *See also* Information technology
 interaction design, 196
 resistance, 232
 society, 261
Tertiary artifacts, Wartofsky's typology, 219
Terveen, L., 23
Thought and Language (Vygotsky), 200
Tool mediation
 activity checklist, 270
 activity theory, 196, 200, 255
 functional organs, 64
Tool-related competencies, functional organs, 64
Tools and concepts, evolution of mind, 57
Transparency, activity theory, 79
Trettvik, J., 81
Trouble ticketing system (TTS), 87
Truex, D., 204

Turner, P., 100
Turner, S., 100

User actions, higher-level, 119–123
User-centered design, 112
User-Monitoring Environments for Activities (UMEA), system
 activity theory, 108, 117, 124
 automatic ranking, 132
 background resources, 132
 expected benefits, 131
 future prospects, 131
 interaction histories, 123–131
 motivation, 123
 project contexts, 123–131
 system overview, 126–129
 use scenario, 129
 window displays, 127

Vitousek, P., 241
Vygotsky, L., 3, 38, 173, 200
Vygotsky's cultural-historical psychology, 30, 35, 50

Warhol, A., 213n
Wartofsky, M., 71, 206, 217
Waste in the Wireless World: The Challenges of Cell Phones (Fishbein), 13
Weight Watchers Program, creativity, 210
Wertsch, J., 3, 65, 188, 190–191, 232
Whittaker, S., 32
Wielinga, R., 206
Wikipedia, 282
Windows, icons, menus and pointing (WIMP), 82
Winner, L., 233
Winograd, T., 5
Wiredu, G., 114
Wireless computers, social practices, 96
Work
 activity theory, 88
 changing nature of, 26
 ethnomethodology, 87
 explicit vs. tacit, 86
Workplace studies
 common problems, 84
 interaction design, 83
 physical-virtual environments, 85

Zinchenko, V., 184, 209
Zone of proximal development, 48, 211